THE VALUE OF A SPIRITUAL LEADERSHIP ELECTIVE IN AN MBA PROGRAMME

Robert Francis Katz

Thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree
Doctor Philosophiae
in
The Department of Industrial Psychology and People Management
in the
Faculty of Management
at the
University of Johannesburg

Cape Town
Promoter: Prof. D. P. J. Smith
May, 2011
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to the following people for their support, without whom this research would not have been possible:

My loving and empathetic wife, Tracey. Your encouragement, support, love and strength helped me endure and transcend one of my toughest life challenges.

My patient research promoter, Professor Dawie Smith. You have revealed to me that there is a special way, a purposeful way, to the challenge of life and living. You have equipped me with tools, techniques and wisdom to manage the challenges across all the dimensions of life. You helped me continually discover my potential.

The willing participants of the one-on-one interviews and their full and engaged participation in the Spiritual Leadership elective at the University of Stellenbosch Business School.

University of Stellenbosch Business School for having the courage to allow the inclusion of the Spiritual Leadership elective in the MBA programme.

Judi Neal for introducing me to Spirituality and Spiritual Leadership on the international stage.

God and the Universe for ongoing guidance and strength to complete the research and share my insights both locally and internationally.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENTS</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES, TABLES AND DIAGRAMS</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OPSOMMING</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 1: RESEARCH ORIENTATION</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Context of the Research</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Statement of the Problem</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Aim of the Research</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 Motivation For and Added Value of the Research</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 Perspective of the Research</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6 Clarification of Core Concepts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6.1 Spirituality and Spiritual Intelligence</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6.2 Leadership</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6.3 Spiritual Leadership</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7 Research Methodology</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.1 Research Design</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.2 Specific Methods for the Research</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.3 Population and Data</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.4 Validity and Reliability of the Research</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.5 Ethical Considerations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.6 Limitations of the Research</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8 Outcomes of the Chapter</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 2: CONCEPTUALISATION OF SPIRITUALITY AND SPIRITUAL LEADERSHIP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Context, Aim and Methodology of the Chapter</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 An Alternative View of Leadership</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 The Concept of Spirituality</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.1 The Emergence of and Trends in Spirituality</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2 What Is Spirituality?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.3 What Is Spiritual Intelligence (SQ)?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Spiritual Leadership</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 Spirituality in the Workplace and the Contribution of Spiritual Leadership</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6 Do Traditional Leadership and Spiritual Leadership Converge?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2
CHAPTER 3: CRITERIA FOR PROGRAMME DEVELOPMENT

3.1 Background and Proposed Outcomes

3.2 Criteria that Highlight the Need for the Programme

3.2.1 What is the Extent of the Problem?

3.2.2 Defining and Identifying the Target of the Development Programme

3.3 The Goals of the Programme

3.4 Criteria to Assess the Programme Theory

3.5 Criteria for Assessing and Monitoring the Programme Process

3.5.1 Assessing the Programme Process

3.5.2 Facilitation Effectiveness as Key to the Effectiveness of the Programme

3.5.3 Workbook/Manual Criteria

3.5.4 The Reader Criteria

3.5.5 Criteria for Assessing the MBA Students (Programme Attendees)

3.6 Criteria to Assess the Outcomes of the Programme

3.7 Criteria to Assess the Efficiency of the Programme

3.8 Conclusion

CHAPTER 4: PROPOSED STRUCTURE FOR A SPIRITUAL LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME

4.1 Significance and Aim of the Chapter

4.2 Recommended Programme Framework and Content

4.2.1 The Goals of The Development Programme

4.2.2 The Theoretical Framework of the Relevant Programme

4.2.3 The Contents of the Development Programme

4.3 Programme Delivery – Implementation and Operation (Workshop and Facilitation)

4.3.1 The Learning Approach

4.3.2 The Programme Process and Service Delivery

4.3.3 Facilitation and Presentation Effectiveness

4.4 Programme Assessment

4.4.1 Programme Outcome Assessment

4.4.2 Programme Efficiency and Effectiveness Assessment

4.5 Student Assessment

4.6 Conclusion

CHAPTER 5: EMPIRICAL RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

5.1 The Aim and Significance of the Chapter

5.2 Empirical Research Design
5.3 Specific Empirical Methods for the Research
5.3.1 Questionnaire Method (One Group Pre-test – Post-Test Design)
5.3.2 Phenomenological Research Method
5.4 Population and Data
5.4.1 Population
5.4.2 Sampling Strategy
5.4.3 Data Collection
5.4.4 Data Treatment
5.5 Validity and Reliability
5.5.1 Internal Validity
5.5.2 Reliability
5.5.3 External Validity
5.6 Ethical Considerations
5.7 Limitations of the Research
5.8 Conclusions Regarding the Outcomes of the Chapter

CHAPTER 6: PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION OF THE EMPIRICAL RESULTS
6.1 The Aim and Significance of the Chapter
6.2 Presentation and Discussion of the Empirical Results
6.2.1 Qualitative Results
6.2.2 Quantitative Results
6.3 Validity and Reliability of the Findings
6.4 Concluding Interpretations
6.5 Conclusion of Outcomes for the Chapter

CHAPTER 7: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS
7.1 The Aim and Significance of this Chapter
7.2 Main Findings
7.2.1 What is meant by the concept of Spirituality (Research Question One)?
7.2.2 What are the relevant criteria for the evaluation of a spiritual leadership elective (Research Question Two)?
7.2.3 What should be the framework of such a spiritual leadership elective (Research Question Three)?
7.2.4 What is the potential value of a spiritual leadership elective to the MBA programme (Research Question Four)?
7.2.5 What impact can a spiritual leadership elective have on the MBA students (Research Question Four)?
7.2.6 What significant contribution can spiritual leadership make to organisations and the workplace (Research Question Five)?

7.2.7 To what extent can the results of the research be generalised to all business schools in South Africa (Research Question Six)?

7.3 Findings Related to the Literature Review and Theory

7.3.1 Spirituality at Work

7.3.2 Spirituality

7.3.3 Spiritual Leadership

7.3.4 The PiPL perspective or theory (The EPL Way)

7.4 Gaps and Deviations in Data (Deviations in Expectations)

7.4.1 What is meant by the concept of Spirituality (Research Question One)?

7.4.2 What are the relevant criteria for the evaluation of a spiritual leadership development programme (Research Question Two)?

7.4.3 What should be the framework of such a spiritual leadership elective (Research Question Three)?

7.4.4 What is the potential value of a spiritual leadership elective to the MBA programme (Research Question Four)?

7.4.5 What impact can a spiritual leadership elective have on MBA students (Research Question Four)?

7.4.6 What significant contribution can spiritual leadership make to organisations and the workplace (Research Question Five)?

7.5 The Larger Relevance and Value of the Research and its Findings

7.6 Recommendations Regarding Implementation of the Framework and Suggested Further Research

7.6.1 Recommendations regarding implementation of the framework

7.6.2 Suggested further research

7.7 Conclusions Regarding the Proposed Outcomes of the Chapter

CHAPTER 8: BIBLIOGRAPHY

CHAPTER 9: APPENDICES

9.1 Themes for Spirituality and the need for spiritual leadership

9.2 What significant contribution can spiritual leadership make to organisations?

9.3 What is the potential value of a spiritual leadership elective to the MBA programme?

9.4 How does it change your perspective regarding leadership?

9.5 What impact can a spiritual leadership have on the MBA students?

9.6 How did you experience the programme?

9.7 How would you format the course?
9.8 Should the duration of the elective be longer?

9.9 Comment on how the elective should be assessed: written exam, a portfolio, an assignment (e.g. an implementation plan for Spirituality at Work).

9.10 What would your expectations be regarding the outcomes of such an elective?

9.11 Spiritual Leadership Development Portfolio

9.12 Research questions linked with portfolio question (in italics)

9.13 Knowledge of Spirituality and Spiritual Leadership

9.14 Spiritual Wellness Profile

9.15 Your Growth Connectedness Index
LIST OF FIGURES, TABLES AND DIAGRAMS

Figure 1.1 Smith’s Life Dimensions House Model .......................................................... 17
Figure 1.2 The Smith Transformer and Wellness Model ................................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
Figure 2.1 Four Orientations toward Religion and Spirituality (Mitroff & Denton, 1999, p. 40) .................................................................................................................... 61
Figure 2.2 Levels of consciousness (“our three minds”) .............................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.

Diagram 2.1 The EPL Pyramid of Leadership and Credibility (influence) ............... Error! Bookmark not defined.
Diagram 4.1 PiPL Self-fulfilling prophecy model ......................................................... 131
Diagram 4.2 Spiritual Leadership Development Programme process ............................................ Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 2.1 Summary of Characteristics Drawn from Various Definitions of Spirituality ................................................................................................................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 2.2 The Psychological Self (soul) versus the Spiritual Self (spirit) .................. 71
Table 2.3 Thoughts and Attitudes Reflecting Spirituality ........................................ Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 2.4 Emotions Reflecting Spirituality ............................................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 2.5 Behaviours that Reflect Spirituality ........................................................ Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 2.6 Summary of Spiritual Definitions ............................................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 3.1 Stages for Programme Development ......................................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 4.1 Affirmation of Needs .................................................................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 4.2 Assessment of Goals ............................................................................... 121
Table 4.3 Framework Support of Goals ...................................................................... 123
Table 4.4 Contents of the Programme Framework .................................................. 126
Table 4.5 Assessment of Process and Service Delivery .............................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 4.6 Facilitation and Presentation Effectiveness ............................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 4.7 Specific Development Programme Effectiveness ..................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 4.8 Workbook Assessment ........................................................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 4.9 Reader Assessment ................................................................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 4.10 Outcome Assessment ............................................................................ Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 4.11 Programme Efficiency And Effectiveness .............................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 5.1 Qualitative Research Trustworthiness ..................................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 6.1 Interview Schedule .................................................................................. 180
Table 6.2 Spiritual Manifestations ........................................................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 6.3 Spiritual Manifestations from Portfolios ................................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 6.4 Support for Spiritual Manifestations in Literature .................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 6.5 Spiritual Leadership Elective Framework Recommendations .......... Error! Bookmark not defined.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>Assessment of the Elective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>The Potential Value of a Spiritual Leadership Elective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>Changes in Perspective Concerning Leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>The Impact of a Spiritual Leadership on the MBA Students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.10</td>
<td>Spiritual Leadership – Contribution to Organisations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.11</td>
<td>Portfolio Results</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.12</td>
<td>Knowledge Questionnaire Results</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.13</td>
<td>Spiritual Wellness Results</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.14</td>
<td>Connectedness Results</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Spirituality versus Religion</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

212

218
ABSTRACT

In the Western world a significant portion of leadership is developed for business and the community through Master of Business Administration (MBA) programmes. To the greatest extent it may mainly be argued that MBA graduates exert a significant influence on both their organisations and their communities. Their development as successful leaders has the potential to, and often does, affect all aspects of the business (for example, finance, marketing, operations, sales, profit and investor relations). MBA graduates bring with them the tools and techniques acquired on the MBA programme which, in turn, affect their approach to problem solving and leadership within their organisations. Generally however, MBA graduates are highly valued in the workplace, despite their lack of experience.

The global crises such as the September 11 terrorist attacks and the subsequent ‘war on terrorism’ including the financial crises of WorldCom, Enron, Tyco and Andersen have caused individuals, leaders and organisations to look for a deeper meaning and purpose (a spiritual journey) in their lives. It may be argued therefore that persons want the workplace to be a meaningful environment as they spend, on average, more than 50% of their time there. The importance of meaning, purpose, hope and compassion in the workplace has also been emphasised by a study performed by Mitroff and Denton (1999, pp. 3-4).

[B]usiness education in this country [United States of America] is devoted overwhelmingly to technical training. This is ironic, because even before Enron, studies showed that executives who fail – financially as well as morally – rarely lack expertise. Rather, they fail because they lack inter-personal skills and practical wisdom what Aristotle called prudence (Bennis & O’Toole, 2005, p. 104, emphasis added).

Therefore the gap in business schools’ curricula is clear and suggestions as to its improvement abound. What these suggestions have in common is the fundamental premise that the issues to be covered should include Spirituality and spiritual leadership interpersonal skills and practical wisdom, philosophy and theology.
The aim of this research is the development of a spiritual leadership framework or paradigm for MBA programmes. The following research questions support the central research problem:

**Research Question One:** What is meant by the concept of Spirituality (including its link to spiritual intelligence, spiritual leadership and its challenge to the traditional leadership view)? (Chapter Two)

**Research Question Two:** What are the relevant criteria for the evaluation of a spiritual leadership development programme? (Chapter Three)

**Research Question Three:** What should be the framework of such a spiritual leadership programme (elective)? (Chapter Four)

**Research Question Four:** What is the potential value of a spiritual leadership elective to the MBA programme, the MBA students and how does it change their perspective regarding leadership? (Chapter Six)

**Research Question Five:** Can spiritual leadership make a significant contribution to organisations? (Chapters Two and Six)

**Research Question Six:** To what extent can the results of this research be generalised to all business schools in South Africa? (Chapter Seven)

In order to answer the research questions, a mixed research method approach was adopted using non-empirical as well as quantitative and qualitative approaches. Experimental Research Design by means of One-Group Pre-test – Post-test design (due to small sample size) within the context of a phenomenological design (Leedy & Ormrod, 2005, p. 224) was adopted. The Evaluation Research Approach, which was the primary approach in addressing the research aims, was adopted to identify the criteria for identifying and recommending a framework for spiritual leadership programme. This approach typically evaluates the need for a programme, the problem it aims to address, the target population, the design (i.e., the theory upon
which it is based), its implementation, impact and efficiency (Rossi, Lipsey & Freeman, 2004, p. 40).

A literature review supported by conceptual analysis was undertaken to explore the concepts of Spirituality, spiritual leadership, traditional leadership and the significant contribution that spiritual leadership may make to organisations (see aforementioned research questions). The literature review should endorse the need for a spiritual leadership programme. The relevant programme theory was identified in the literature review.

The implementation of the spiritual leadership framework can have a larger relevance in affecting the following (observed from questionnaires, portfolios and interviews):

- Enhancing meaning, purpose and the worth of work in the workplace.
- Assist organisations to become both people- and profit-focused.
- Organisations will potentially become more aware of their impact on the physical environment.
- Problem-solving in organisations potentially will be addressed with a new mindset (that is, a spiritual mindset).
- Organisations will potentially focus on work-life balance which could support staff retention, staff productivity, staff fulfilment and improved relationships both at home and in the workplace.
- Corporate Social Responsibility programmes have the potential to become more core than is typically common, resulting in organisations with a focus on serving the community.
- The MBA programme within the business schools will be enhanced by:
  - being holistic (not primarily analytical-focused).
  - covering spiritual leadership and its related contribution.
  - adding value to the other modules in the curricula.
  - increasing effectiveness of syndicate groups.
  - enhancing performance of lecturers.
o producing graduates that can potentially add greater value to individuals, their organisations, their families and the community.

add to the body of knowledge regarding a *spiritual leadership framework/structure* that can add value to MBA programmes